

Recommendations by the Accreditation Team and Report of the Accreditation Revisit for Professional Preparation Programs at Bard College

October 1-3, 2013 and December 10, 2013

Overview of this Report

This agenda report includes the findings of the accreditation revisit conducted at Bard College. The report of the team presents the findings based upon review of the Institutional Site Visit documentation, review of supporting evidence and interviews with representative constituencies.

Recommendations

On the basis of the report, the accreditation revisit team recommends the following:

1. That the stipulations from the 2012 accreditation visit be removed.
2. That the accreditation decision be changed from **Accreditation with Stipulations to Accreditation**.

Common Standards and Program Standard Decisions For All Programs Offered by the Institution

	Met	Met with Concerns	Not Met
1) Educational Leadership	X		
2) Unit and Program Assessment and Evaluation	X		
3) Resources	X		
4) Faculty and Instructional Personnel	X		
5) Admission	X		
6) Advice and Assistance	X		
7) Field Experience and Clinical Practice	X		
8) District Employed Supervisors	X		
9) Assessment of Candidate Competence	X		

Program Standards

	Total Program Standards	Program Standards		
		Met	Met with Concerns	Not Met
Multiple Subject	19	19		
Single Subject	19	19		

The site visit was completed in accordance with the procedures approved by the Committee on Accreditation regarding the activities of the site visit:

- Preparation for the Accreditation Visit
- Preparation of the Institutional Self-Study Report

- Selection and Composition of the Accreditation Team
- Intensive Evaluation of Program Data
- Preparation of the Accreditation Team Report

**Commission on Teacher Credentialing
Committee on Accreditation
Revisit Team Report**

Institution: Bard College, California

Credential Programs: Single Subject Preliminary Teacher Preparation

Dates of Revisit: October 1-3, 2013
December 10, 2013

Location of Revisit: Tulare College Center, College of the Sequoias
Longy School of Music of Bard College, Los Angeles

Revisit Team Leader: **Caryl Hodges**
University of San Francisco

Team Member: **Sharon Russell**
CalStateTEACH

Staff to the Revisit: **Gay Roby**
Commission on Teacher Credentialing

Overview:

This item is the accreditation team report for the October 1-3, 2013 (Tulare Campus) and December 10, 2013 (Los Angeles Campus) revisit to Bard College, California. The initial visit took place a year earlier on October 24-26, 2012. This item provides the report of the revisit team as well as recommendations regarding three (3) stipulations and the accreditation status.

Recommendations of the 2013 Revisit Team

1. That the three stipulations from the 2012 accreditation visit be removed.
2. The accreditation decision be changed from **Accreditation with Stipulations** to **Accreditation**.

2012 Stipulations	2013 Revisit Team Recommendations
1. That within one year, Bard College provide the Committee on Accreditation a written response with evidence that addresses the four (4) Common Standards issues identified in this report and demonstrate that these have been addressed.	Remove
2. That within one year, Bard College provide the Committee on Accreditation a written response with evidence that addresses the three (3) Program Standards issues identified in this report and demonstrates that these have been addressed	Remove
3. That within one year, Bard College undergo a focused revisit by the team lead and consultant, and, as required, members of the accreditation team.	Remove

**Report of the Accreditation Revisit to
Bard College
October 1-3, 2013 (Tulare Campus)
December 10, 2013 (Los Angeles Campus)**

Background

A COA accreditation team conducted a site visit at Bard College on October 24-26, 2012. On the basis of the accreditation team report from that visit, the COA made the following accreditation decision for Bard College and all of its credential programs: Accreditation with Stipulations. The team report from the 2012 visit can be found at: https://info.ctc.ca.gov/fmi/xsl/cnt/13-Bard%20College%20Accred%20Report-FINAL.pdf?-db=PSD_Program_Sponsors_DB&-lay=web_Accreditation_Reports&-recid=322&-field=COA_Report_Site_Visit.

The institution was required to respond to the stipulations and prepare for a revisit within one year of the accreditation action. A visit to the Bard College Program in Tulare on October 1-3, 2013 took place after which a status update was provided to the COA in October 2013 (see <http://www.ctc.ca.gov/educator-prep/coa-agendas/2013-10/2013-10-item-18.pdf>). At that time the team requested, and the COA granted, that the revisit be extended to allow the team the opportunity to review the credential program offered at the new Los Angeles location. As a result, the second part of the revisit took place at the Longy School of Music at Bard College in Los Angeles on December 10, 2013. The two part revisit was conducted by the team lead, one team member, and a CTC staff consultant. In response to the stipulations, the institution prepared documents with referenced supporting evidence indicating how each of the stipulations had been addressed and what changes had been made in areas of the standards identified by the team as needing attention. The institution prepared an interview schedule, at both sites, of the constituencies identified by the team.

It is important to note that since the original visit in October 2012, Bard has experienced several changes in their program. The Central Valley program, previously located at Paramount Academy Charter School in Delano, California, has moved and currently has offices/holds classes in the College of the Sequoia campus in Tulare, California. This has resulted in changes to the program field practicum placements for candidates in the first two quarters. Additional changes have been made based on aggregate data collected for program review and improvements detailed under the Common Standard 2 findings below. A new Master of Arts in Teaching (MAT)/Credential (English Language Arts and History Social Science) cohort has begun at the Tulare site as well as a new Master of Arts/Credential (English Language Arts and History Social Science) cohort in the same subject matter content areas at the Los Angeles site. These two cohorts have the same schedule, some of the same faculty, and are completing the same program which has been adjusted based on aggregate data collected for program review and improvement.

In addition, a MAT/Music credential program began in January 2013 as the result of the merger of Longy School of Music in Cambridge, Massachusetts with Bard College. The Longy School of Music at Bard College established the Los Angeles campus in collaboration with the Los Angeles Philharmonic and Heart of Los Angeles (HOLA), a well-established nonprofit organization that provides afterschool and summer programs, including academic tutoring as

well as extensive arts and athletic programming for Los Angeles youth. The MAT/Credential program courses are held at the HOLA campus. The first cohort of MAT/Credential candidates completed the program in December 2013. A second cohort began in Summer 2013 and will complete the program in Summer 2014.

The Longy School of Music of Bard College MAT/Credential program administrative leadership includes the MAT Site Director (in Los Angeles) and the Director of Teacher Education and Educational Initiatives (in Cambridge, Massachusetts) and starting in January, 2014 a full-time program administrator on site in Los Angeles, supported by six part-time music faculty. In addition to the staff and faculty in Los Angeles, the program is supported by several administrative and academic staff at Longy's main campus in Cambridge, MA. The Longy MAT/Credential Program follows the same program design as the Bard MAT/Credential program and works closely with Bard's MAT/Credential Director for California and the program shares some education faculty.

The team reviewed documents provided by Bard College and Longy School of Music prior to and during the visits and conducted interviews with faculty, district partners, Advisory Committee members, graduates (Tulare Program only), current candidates, Bard College/Longy School of Music supervisors, and District-employed supervisors (mentor teachers) for both the Central Valley MAT Credential Program currently located in Tulare, California and the Los Angeles programs. The team also conducted interviews with Bard College and Longy School of Music administrators (Deans, Directors, Administrative staff, TPA Coordinator).

After the review of all submitted documents and interviews, the team reached the following conclusions:

Stipulation 1: *That within one year, Bard College provide the Committee on Accreditation a written response with evidence that addresses the four (4) Common Standards issues identified in this report and demonstrate that these have been addressed.*

Common Standards

2012 Team Finding	2013 Revisit Team Finding
<p><u>Common Standard 1 (Met with Concerns)</u> Two factors support the team recommendation for the decision that this standard is met with concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The first credential cohort working toward a California credential began in July 2012 and will not be placed in local district until their fourth quarter in Spring 2013, collaborations and coordination with stakeholders is still in the initial stage resulting in insufficient time to involve relevant stakeholders in the organization, coordination, and governance of the program. • The current process to reestablish an Advisory Board indicates the need to provide this group with time to fully 	<p><u>Common Standard 1 (Met)</u> The first credential cohort (Tulare) working toward a California credential completed the program in summer 2013. As documented by a review of the program update, the fieldwork experience flow chart, and interviews with program administrators, field supervisors, candidates, program completers, mentors, and program partners, the Bard Credential Program in the Central Valley engaged stakeholders (districts, community organizations) in the organization, coordination, and governance of the program located in the Central Valley (Delano/Tulare).</p> <p>The first credential cohort (Los Angeles) working toward a California Single Subject Music Credential completed the program in December 2013. As documented by a review of the program, fieldwork</p>

2012 Team Finding	2013 Revisit Team Finding
<p>engage in the process of reviewing program policies, activities, and data in order to participate in ongoing program improvement.</p>	<p>experience documents, agreements with district partners, agendas/minutes of collaboration meetings, and interviews with program administrators, field supervisors, candidates, program completers, mentors, and program partners, the Longy School of Music at Bard College Credential Program in Los Angeles engaged stakeholders (districts, community organizations) in the organization, coordination, and governance of the program located at the HOLA campus in Los Angeles.</p> <p>Documents and interviews indicate that the Bard Advisory Committee has been reestablished and that the Committee is meeting as planned (twice a year) to engage in the process of program review and improvement, as well as to provide advice and assistance.</p> <p>Documents and interviews indicate that the Longy School of Music at Bard College Advisory Committee has been established and that the Committee is meeting as planned (twice a year) to engage in the process of program review and improvement, as well as to provide advice and assistance.</p>
<p><u>Common Standard 2 (Met with Concerns)</u> The factor that supports the team recommendations for the decision that this standard is met with concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The first credential cohort began in July 2012 and will complete the credential program in summer 2013. Given that this review was early in the process, there is not enough evidence to support that this standard is fully met. In order for this standard to be fully met, the team will need to see evidence of aggregated candidate assessment data for at least one (1) academic year, as well as evidence that the program is using data for program improvement. 	<p><u>Common Standard 2 (Met)</u> Bard credential (English Language Arts and History Social Science) programs Tulare and Los Angeles sites: As documented by assessment reports, sample assessment documents, and a presentation of data instrument and data analysis, evidence of aggregated candidate assessment data for one (1) academic year was provided as well as detailed evidence that the data was used to implement specific changes for program improvement that are now in place for the new cohorts. Data was collected throughout the year from a range of sources including program faculty, supervisors, candidates, and district-employed supervisors. The two primary sources of data were the Bard Tracking of Progress (TOP) instrument and CalTPA.</p> <p>Longy School of Music at Bard College Credential (Music) Program, Los Angeles site: As documented by assessment reports, sample assessment documents, and interviews with administrators, aggregated candidate assessment data has been collected for one (1) academic year and detailed evidence of the use of that data to implement specific changes for program improvement were put in place for the Summer 2013 cohort and will be put in place for the cohort being recruited for Summer 2014. Data was collected</p>

2012 Team Finding	2013 Revisit Team Finding
	<p>throughout the year from a range of sources including program faculty, supervisors, candidates, and district-employed supervisors. The two primary sources of data were the Bard Tracking of Progress (TOP) instrument and CalTPA.</p>
<p><u>Common Standard 7 (Met with Concerns)</u> The factor that supports the team recommendation for the decision that this standard is met with concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Though there is evidence of partnerships with local school districts, especially in professional development offered to local teachers, and a plan to constitute an Advisory Board, there is no evidence that partners participated in the design, implementation, and evaluation of the planned sequence of clinical experiences. In addition, the program has criteria for selection of school sites, effective clinical personnel, and site-based supervising personnel and is working to improve relationships with school partners; however, there is no evidence that the program has collaborated with partners in establishing these criteria. • Because the program has not completed an entire academic year as an approved program, evidence was not available to verify the details of the final clinical experience in local public schools. 	<p><u>Common Standard 7 (Met)</u> As documented by a review of the program update, the fieldwork experience flow chart, and interviews with program administrators, field supervisors, candidates, program completers, mentors, and program partners, the Bard MAT/Credential Program in the Central Valley provides candidates with a planned sequence of field experiences that will support them in developing the knowledge and skills to be effective teachers of diverse students. In advisory committee documents and interviews with advisory committee members, reviewers found evidence that school district partners collaborated with the program to evaluate and improve the planned sequence of clinic experiences.</p> <p>As documented by a review of the program update, and interviews with program administrators, field supervisors, candidates, cooperating teachers, and program partners, Longy School of Music of Bard College MAT/Music Credential Program, Los Angeles' candidates complete a yearlong supervised residency in both YOLA (Youth Orchestra LA, under the auspices of the LA Philharmonic) at HOLA (Heart of Los Angeles) and public school classrooms, and four quarters of "Teaching as Clinical Practice." The sequence of field experiences provides music candidates the opportunity to develop knowledge and skills to be effective teachers of diverse students. In interviews with community and school district partners, reviewers found evidence of collaboration with community and school district partners to evaluate and improve the sequence of planned clinical experiences.</p>
<p><u>Common Standard 8 (Met with Concerns)</u> The factor that supports the team recommendation for the decision that this standard is met with concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The program has not completed its four term clinical sequence as an approved program and therefore data are not yet available about mentors who will serve in the final clinical experience. At the time of the visit, the program was still in the 	<p><u>Common Standards 8 (Met)</u> As documented by a review of the program update, workshop agendas, contracts, and memoranda of understanding and interviews with program administrators, supervisors, mentors, an external evaluator, advisory committee members, and program partners, Bard MAT/Credential Program in the Central Valley has a well-documented process for selecting district-based mentors who are knowledgeable of the academic content standards and experienced in teaching diverse students and</p>

2012 Team Finding	2013 Revisit Team Finding
<p>process of identifying mentors for the clinical experience outside of PBA and securing agreements with local districts for them to serve in those roles. As a result, reviewers were unable to verify that proposed mentors in local public schools outside of PBA were certified and experienced in either.</p>	<p>differentiating instruction. The criteria for selection and training for mentors were verified through document review and mentor interviews. Mentors engage in program sponsored professional development prior to and during the mentoring experience, assess the candidate, and communicate regularly with the field supervisor. Program administrators evaluate mentors through an analysis of the TOP materials and discussions with field supervisors.</p> <p>As documented by a review of the program update, contracts, and memoranda of understanding and interviews with program administrators, fieldwork supervisors, cooperating teachers, and program partners, the Longy School of Music at Bard College MAT/Credential Program has a clearly established process for identifying district-based cooperating teachers who are knowledgeable in the academic content standards and experienced in working with diverse students. Cooperating teachers are oriented to the program and trained in the TOP assessment instrument. They communicate regularly with the program field supervisor and provide candidate formative assessment using the TOP. They are recognized by a stipend and evaluated by the program administrator.</p>

Based on this evidence, the team determined the issues identified in Stipulation 1, related to the Bard MAT/Credential (ELA & HSS) offered in the Central Valley (Delano, Tulare) and the Los Angeles site, as well as the Longy School of Music at Bard College MAT/Credential (Music) have been addressed.

Stipulation 2: *That within one year, Bard College provide the Committee on Accreditation a written response with evidence that addresses the three (3) Program Standards issues identified in this report and demonstrates that these have been addressed.*

Program Standards

2012 Team Finding	2013 Revisit Team Finding
<p><u>Program Standard 2 (Met with Concerns)</u> The team sought evidence that sponsors of the preliminary teacher preparation program had established collaborative partnerships that contribute substantively to the quality and effectiveness of the design and implementation of candidate preparation. Currently, a part-time consultant is assisting in developing partnerships and placements with local school districts. The team learned that the Advisory Board to the MAT credential program was dissolved and that Bard MAT is in the process of reconstituting the committee. At the beginning of the process to establish a program in the Central Valley, Bard College personnel met with school districts from Delano to Porterville, and from Avenal to Bakersfield. Since the first credential cohort began in July 2012 and candidates will not be placed in local district until their fourth quarter in Spring 2013, collaborations and coordination with stakeholders is still in the initial stage.</p>	<p><u>Program Standard 2 (Met)</u> As evidenced by agendas, sign-in sheets, and interviews with advisory board members, the Bard MAT/Credential Program in the Central Valley Advisory Committee has been reconstituted, become active, and contributed to program improvement and re-design. The Committee has reviewed program performance data and has collaborated on curricular and clinical experiences modifications. In addition, as evidenced by agendas, minutes, and sign-in sheets members of the program administration have collaborated with local stakeholders in such venues as Induction Consortia, Community Alliances, and New Teacher Development activities. The program administration makes its own clinical placements and has established MOUs with school partners and contracts with school mentors thereby attesting to the clear communication and collaboration among stakeholders.</p> <p>As evidenced by agendas, minutes, and interviews with members, the Longy School of Music at Bard College Advisory Board has been active and contributed to the program development, design, and on-going review for program improvement. Meeting documents, copies of Memorandum of Understanding, and interviews indicate that program administration has collaborated with local stakeholders including districts and community alliances and that these collaborations contribute to the quality and effectiveness of the design and implementation of candidate preparation.</p>
<p><u>Program Standard 8 (Met with Concerns)</u> Since the first credential cohort began in July 1 and the program is still in process, it is unclear at this stage of the program how this standard is fully addressed. In the team’s review of the response to the self-study and syllabi, the team did not find evidence of this standard being completely addressed. The program needs to develop a detailed report on how each course contributes to meeting the standards. Interviews with candidates indicated a lack of consistency in which discipline specific courses intersected with the education core and the lab.</p>	<p><u>Program Standard 8 (Met)</u> The Bard MAT/Credential Program in the Central Valley Standard 8 Implementation Matrix, MAT syllabi, and interviews with faculty, program completers, and program candidates provide detailed evidence of the ways in which the content and content pedagogy coursework meet the standard for subject-specific content instruction in English, Mathematics, and History-Social Science. Candidates, program completers, and faculty clearly articulated the connection between Bard’s program of study, clinical practice and the California Academic Content Standards and the Common Core State Standards.</p> <p>The Longy School of Music at Bard College</p>

2012 Team Finding	2013 Revisit Team Finding
	<p>MAT/Credential (Music) Program Standard 8 Implementation Matrix, course syllabi, and interviews with faculty and program candidates document how content and content pedagogy coursework meet the standard for subject-specific content instruction in music. Candidates, faculty, and cooperating teachers spoke to the connection between the program of study and clinical experiences and the California Academic Content Standards.</p>
<p><u>Program Standard 13 (Met with Concerns)</u> Since the first credential cohort began in July 1 and they are still in process, it is unclear at this stage of the program how this standard is fully addressed. In review of the self-study document and syllabi, the team did not find consistent evidence of this standard being completely addressed. Candidates expressed that they felt comfortable with their preparation at this time. However, the team needs additional information on how the needs of special populations are covered in the remainder of the program. Program needs to develop a detailed report on how each course contributes to meeting the standards.</p>	<p><u>Program Standard 13</u> The Bard MAT/Credential Program in the Central Valley Standard 13 Implementation Matrix, MAT syllabi, interviews with faculty, program completers, and mentors provide detailed evidence of the ways in which the coursework and sequence of clinical experiences establish multiple and embedded opportunities for candidates to learn to differentiate instruction and work with students with special needs in the general education classroom.</p> <p>An emphasis on addressing the needs of diverse learners and issues of English language acquisition and special needs students in inclusive classrooms is evidenced in multiple courses and is put into practice during the cycle of practice in public school classrooms.</p> <p>The Longy School of Music at Bard College MAT/Credential (Music) Program Standard 13 Implementation Matrix, course syllabi, interviews with faculty, cooperating teachers, and program candidates document how coursework, workshops, and clinical experiences provide opportunities for candidates to learn to differentiate instruction and work with students with special needs in the music classroom.</p> <p>An emphasis on addressing the needs of diverse learners and issues of English language acquisition and special needs students in music classrooms is evidenced in multiple courses and is put into practice during the cycle of practice in public school classrooms, especially at Youth Orchestra LA (YOLA).</p>

Based on this evidence, the team determined the issues identified in Stipulation 2, related to the Bard MAT/Credential (ELA & HSS) offered in the Central Valley (Delano, Tulare) and the Los Angeles site, as well as the Longy School of Music at Bard College MAT/Credential (Music) have been addressed.